

COPPEIUFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

# REPORT ON THE I BRAZILIAN MEETING ON RESEARCH INTEGRITY, SCIENCE AND PUBLICATION ETHICS (I BRISPE)

(Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo, December 10, 13, 14, 15, 16, 2010)

The First Brazilian Meeting on Research Integrity, Science and Publication Ethics (I BRISPE) was the first attempt to establish a national forum in Brazil to address general issues related to global concerns about research integrity (RI) and responsible conduct of research (RCR). Whereas many countries such as the US, the UK, Germany, Canada, China and Japan, among others, have been active in fostering discussions on RI/RCR, Brazil has not taken a significant role. The I BRISPE thus aimed to make Brazilian researchers, especially in the sciences, become familiar with this current debate and also share their views and questions about international assumptions on RI/RCR, about misconduct problems in academia, perceptions of plagiarism in the sciences and current editorial policies, such as retractions.

The I BRISPE was an initiative associated with an academic project on research integrity supported by Carlos Chagas Filho Foundation for Research Support in the State of Rio de Janeiro (FAPERJ), PAPD 2009. The project was conducted from December 2009 and March 2011 through a collaboration between the Alberto Luiz Coimbra Institute - Graduate School and Research in Engineering (COPPE/UFRJ) and the Science Education Program of the Medical Biochemistry Institute (PEGeD/IBqM/UFRJ). The I BRISPE was thus initially planned by COPPE, in collaboration with IBqM/UFRJ. Their efforts were then joined by the Brazilian Center for Physics Research (CBPF), in collaboration with the Brazilian Institute for Science and Technology (IBICT), the University of São Paulo (USP), and the National Institute for Space Research (INPE), in collaboration with the Inter-American Institute for Global Change Research (IAI). The organization of the event was led by Sonia Vasconcelos (in charge of FAPERJ RI/RCR project), with the contribution of the following collaborators:

José Carlos Pinto, PhD, Professor at PEQ/COPPE/UFRJ, Coordinator of the Laboratory of Modeling, Simulation and Control of Chemical Processes (LMSCP)/PEQ/UFRJ; Member of the Brazilian Academy of Sciences



COPPE|UFRJ - CBPF - USP - INPE

**Aquilino Senra,** PhD, Professor at the Nuclear Engineering Program at COPPE, Vice Director of COPPE/UFRJ; Member of the Brazilian Academy of Sciences

**Hatisaburo Masuda,** PhD, Professor at IBqM/UFRJ, Coordinator of the Science Education Program at IBqM/UFRJ

**Martha Sorenson,** PhD, Professor at IBqM/ UFRJ, Former Vice-President of the Society for Molecular Biology and Biochemistry (SBBq)

**Marisa Palácios**, PhD, Professor at the Collective Health Institute (IESC) and Coordinator of the Committee for Research Ethics (CEP/IESC), UFRJ, Fiscal Counselor for the Brazilian Society for Bioethics (SBB)

**Adalberto Vieyra,** PhD, Professor at the Carlos Chagas Filho Biophysics Institute (IBCCF), UFRJ, Area Coordinator of Biological Sciences II at the Agency for the Advancement of Higher Education Personnel (CAPES); Member of the Brazilian Academy of Sciences

**André Pinto,** PhD, Researcher at the Brazilian Center for Physics Research (CBPF), Vice-President of the Materials Science of the Brazilian Society for Microscopy and Microanalysis (SBMM)

Maria Nélida Gonzalez de Gomes, PhD, Research Collaborator at the Brazilian Institute for Information in Science and Technology (IBICT)

**Holm Tiessen**, PhD, Director of the Inter-American Institute for Global Change Research (IAI) **Christopher Martius**, PhD, Assistant Director of Science Programs at IAI

Carlos Nobre, PhD, Director of the Center for Earth System Science at the National Institute for Space Research (INPE); Member of the Brazilian Academy of Sciences

**Sérgio Adorno,** PhD, Professor at the Sociology Department, Faculty of Philosophy, Letters and Human Sciences at the University of São Paulo (USP), UNESCO Chair on Education for Peace, Human Rights, Democracy and Tolerance

#### **General Aim of the I BRISPE:**

Include Brazil in the group of countries that have made RI/RCR policies part of the agenda of institutions and funding agencies and stimulate the involvement of the country's academic community in the development of policies and in decision making concerning ethics and research integrity at the international level.

#### **Specific Aims:**

• Especially among young researchers, raise awareness of RI/RCR demands in today's research setting and call attention to the relevance of these demands for their role as authors and future supervisors.



COPPE|UFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

- Attract the attention of Brazilian scientific societies and editors of academic journals to the growing necessity for developing clear publication ethics policies.
- Assess the possibilities of including RI/RCR- related activities/initiatives in the agenda of the Brazilian research community.

#### **Invitations:**

Apart from invitations and announcements made to the academic community of UFRJ, CBPF, IBICT, INPE, IAI and USP, invitations and requests for publicity for the I BRISPE were made to professors at many universities, such as the University of the State of Rio de Janeiro (UERJ), Fluminense Federal University (UFF), Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (UNIRIO), State University of Campinas (UNICAMP), Federal University of Bahia (UFBA), and University of Brasilia (UnB), among others. Formal invitations were also sent to the Brazilian Ministry of Science and Technology (MCT) and to all research institutions linked to MCT.

Formal invitation letters were also sent to the Brazilian Academy of Sciences (ABC) and the Brazilian Society for the Advancement of Science (SBPC). Major Brazilian Scientific Societies were also invited, such as the Brazilian Society for Biochemistry and Molecular Biology (SBBq), the Brazilian Society for Chemistry (SBQ), the Brazilian Society for Physics (SBQ), the Brazilian Society for Bioethics (SBB), the Brazilian Society for Catalysis (SBCat), the Federation of Societies for Experimental Biology (FESBE) and the Brazilian Society for Microscopy and Microanalysis (SBMM). Formal invitations were sent to the Brazilian Scientific Editors' Association (ABEC) and all Brazilian editors linked to The Scientific Electronic Library Online (SciELO) network were invited. Among Brazilian funding agencies, the Coordination for the Advancement of Higher Education Personnel (CAPES), the Brazilian National Council for Science and Technology (CNPq), FAPERJ, and the State of São Paulo Research Foundation (FAPESP) were invited to participate and take part in one of the roundtables. Unfortunately, only representatives of FAPERJ and FAPESP were able to participate. All the invitations made to institutions or individual researchers included a request for dissemination of the information about the I BRISPE meetings at the recipient's department/institution.



COPPEIUFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

# **Support:**

The I BRISPE was supported by FAPERJ and partially sponsored by COPPE/UFRJ, by IBqM/UFRJ, by Graduate Program of Bioethics, Applied Ethics and Collective Health – PPGBIOS (an association that includes UFRJ; the Oswaldo Cruz Foundation – FIOCRUZ; UERJ; and UFF). USP and IAI sponsored coffee breaks for Venues III and IV. The National Science Foundation (NSF) contributed through sponsorship for Dr. Nicholas Steneck to attend the meetings. The US Office of Research Integrity (ORI) provided official backing through Dr. Cynthia Richard (Director of the Extramural Research Program), although financial assistance was not possible at the time of the meetings.

### **Attendance:**

The I BRISPE was attended by about 170 participants from public and private institutions, mostly from Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo, although at least 205 registered (around 95% through the conference website). Apart from the 170 attendees, 88 participants virtually attended the I BRISPE in Venue III (USP), in real time over the Internet. In terms of official representation of the institutions involved in the organization of the meetings, UFRJ was represented by Professor Aquilino Senra (Vice-Director of COPPE/UFRJ), Professor Edson Watanabe (Academic Director of COPPE); Professor Hatisaburo Masuda (Coordinator of the Science Education Program/ IBqM) and Professor Marisa Palácios (Coordinator of the Research Ethics Committee – CEP-IESC); CBPF was represented by Professor Ronald Cintra Shellard (Vice Director of CBPF); IBICT was represented by Professor Lena Vania Pinheiro (Coordinator for Teaching and Research in Information Science and Technology of IBICT) and Professor Maria Lúcia Maciel (Coordinator of the Interdisciplinary Laboratory for Information and Knowledge – LIINC/IBICT); INPE was represented by Dr. Carlos Nobre (Director of the Center for Earth System Science/INPE); IAI was represented by Dr. Holm Tiessen (Director of IAI) and USP was represented by Professors Esmeralda Negrão (Advisor for the Pro-Rector of Extension and Culture), Professor José Clovis Lima (Advisor for the Pro-Rector of



First Brazilian Meeting on Research Integrity, Science and Publication Ethics

December 10, 13, 14, 15, 16, 2010

COPPE|UFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

Extension and Culture) and Professor Sérgio Adorno (UNESCO Chair on Education for Peace, Human Rights, Democracy and Tolerance at USP).

Overall, the I BRISPE promoted a timely initial discussion on current topics related to research integrity at local and global settings. However, representation by Brazilian Scientific Societies was minor and a more active role of these organizations had been expected. Although some of them helped with publicity for the meetings, namely, The Brazilian Society for Biochemistry and Molecular Biology (SBBq), The Brazilian Society for Bioethics (SBB), The Brazilian Society for Microscopy and Microanalysis (SBMM), The Brazilian Society for Computational and Applied Mathematics (SBMAC), and the Federation of Societies for Experimental Biology (FESBE), other major Societies did not respond to invitation letters sent to them on behalf of the I BRISPE Organizing Committee. Concerning Brazilian editors, participation was also minor, although invitations were officially made by SciELO (Scientific Electronic Library Online), through the support and involvement of Abel Packer (Operational Coordinator of SciELO).

As a first effort to promote discussion on RI/RCR in Brazil, however, the I BRISPE was considered a real success. Until December 2010, the country had no resources at the national and international levels that offered information as well as materials addressing RI/RCR. Now, the I BRISPE (<a href="http://www.ibrispe.coppe.ufrj.br/index.php">http://www.ibrispe.coppe.ufrj.br/index.php</a>) has a pioneering role in this context and its website is listed as an international resource on RI/RCR by the NSF (<a href="http://www.nsf.gov/od/oise/intl-research-integrity.jsp">http://www.nsf.gov/od/oise/intl-research-integrity.jsp</a>). Additionally, we have been informed of continuous efforts towards RI/RCR initiatives in graduate programs of several professors who attended the meetings in Rio and São Paulo.

# **Academic Program and Major Speakers:**

The program for the I BRISPE was organized as a series of roundtables, following a basic format for the four Venues, (see Programs for Venue I (COPPE/UFRJ), II (CBPF), II (USP), and IV (INPE) at <a href="http://www.ibrispe.coppe.ufrj.br/venue1.php">http://www.ibrispe.coppe.ufrj.br/venue1.php</a>), and workshops\*. At the international level, the speakers invited for the I BRISPE have been acknowledged as having key roles in the

\* Workshops proposed for Monday, December 13, at COPPE/UFRJ, were changed to a single session on Plagiarism/Self-Plagiarism and RCR policies.



COPPE|UFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

international debate on RI/RCR and Academic Plagiarism. They are Dr. Nicholas Steneck (Director of the Research Ethics Program at the University of Michigan; Dr. Elizabeth Wager (Chair of the Committee on Publication Ethics, COPE); and Dr. Miguel Roig (Professor at St.John's University).

At the national level, the speakers invited have been acknowledged as having an important contribution to RI in the public understanding of science (Dr. Carlos Nobre, who also spoke on RI in the discussion on climate change results at the Second World Conference on Research Integrity, 2010) and to factors affecting Brazilian research funding (Dr. Jerson Lima da Silva, Scientific Director of FAPERJ, and Dr. Fernando Dias Almeida (Advisor for the Director of FAPESP).

# **Materials from the Meeting:**

A section entitled "Materials from the Meetings", containing major presentations at the I BRISPE is available at <a href="http://www.ibrispe.coppe.ufrj.br/material.php">http://www.ibrispe.coppe.ufrj.br/material.php</a> .

# **Publicity on the Meeting:**

The I BRISPE gained significant press coverage at the national and international levels. In addition to publicity through the COPPE press office and those of IBqM/UFRJ, CBPF, IBICT, INPE, IAI and USP, the event received wide notice. The following links include most of the avenues of publicity:

National:

COPPE/UFRJ

http://www.planeta.coppe.ufrj.br/artigo.php?artigo=1278

IBqM/UFRJ

http://www.bioqmed.ufrj.br/conteudo\_view.asp?id=270

Instituto de Ciências Biomédicas (ICB)/UFRJ

http://www.icb.ufrj.br/index.php?option=com\_content&task=view&id=813



COPPE|UFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

**UFRJ** 

http://www.ufrj.br/detalha noticia.php?codnoticia=11043

Laboratório Nacional de Células-Tronco Embrionárias (LANCE)

http://www.lance-ufrj.org/eventos.html

**CBPF** 

http://portal.cbpf.br/index.php?page=Noticias.VerNoticia&id=397

**IBICT** 

http://www.ibict.br/noticia.php?id=747

**INPE** 

http://www.inpe.br/noticias/noticia.php?Cod Noticia=2363

IAI

http://www.iai.int/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=114&Itemid=128

**USP** 

http://www.usp.br/agen/?p=42186

**Universidade Federal Fluminense (UFF)** 

http://www.proppi.uff.br/node/1781

Universidade Federal Rural do Rio de Janeiro (UFRRJ)

http://www.ufrrj.br/portal/modulo/home/evento.php?evento=1048

Fundação para o Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (FIOTEC), Fundação Oswaldo Cruz (FIOCRUZ)

http://www.fiotec.fiocruz.br/paginas/noticias/NoticiasDetalhes.aspx?IDInformacao=313



COPPE|UFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

Fundação de Desenvolvimento da Pesquisa (FUNDEP), Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais (UFMG)

http://www.fundep.ufmg.br/pagina/899/brazilian-meeting-on-research-integrity--science-and-publication-ethics.aspx

Radio UFMG Educativa

http://www.ufmg.br/online/radio/arquivos/017633.shtml

Comunidade Virtual dos Editores Científicos

http://cvirtual-ccs.bvsalud.org/tiki-read article.php?articleId=483

Rede SciELO

http://ecos-redescielo.bvsalud.org/tiki-read\_article.php?articleId=10

Sociedade Brasileira de Bioquímica e Biologia Molecular (SBBq)

http://www.sbbq.org.br/v2/index.php?option=com\_content&task=view&id=70&Itemid=87

Federação de Sociedades de Biologia Experimental (FESBE)

http://www.fesbe.org.br/v5/index.php

Sociedade Brasileira de Bioética (SBB)

http://www.sbbioetica.org.br/index.aspx?p=6

Sociedade Brasileira de Microscopia e Microanálise (SBMM)

http://www.sbmm.org.br/ver\_evento.php?id\_evento=16

Sociedade Brasileira de Matemática Aplicada e Computacional (SBMAC)

http://www.sbmac.org.br/publi\_bol\_2010.php#a1b18n5

Agência Bras<mark>ileira de Inteligência (ABIN)</mark>

http://www.abin.gov.br/modules/articles/article.php?id=6993



COPPE|UFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

#### **Portal Brasil**

http://www.brasil.gov.br/noticias/arquivos/2010/12/9/etica-e-pesquisa-cientifica-e-tema-de-encontro-inter-americano

Ministério da Ciência e Tecnologia (MCT)

http://www.mct.gov.br/index.php/content/view/327595.html

Jornal da Ciência (SBPC)

http://www.jornaldaciencia.org.br/Detalhe.jsp?id=75016

**Jornal O Globo,** "Falsificação, plágio e conflito de interesses são temas de eventos em Rio e São Paulo", 10/12/2010

#### Jornal do Brasil

http://www.jb.com.br/ciencia-e-tecnologia/noticias/2010/12/11/pesquisadores-discutem-etica-na-pesquisa-cientifica-em-evento-no-rio-e-em-sao-paulo/

## Revista CBN

http://cbn.globoradio.globo.com/programas/revista-cbn/2010/12/05/NESTA-SEMANA-SERA-REALIZADO-O-PRIMEIRO-ENCONTRO-BRASILEIRO-DE-INTEGRIDADE-DA-PESQUISA-CIE.htm

## **Agência FAPESP**

http://www.agencia.fapesp.br/materia/13094/agenda/brazilian-meeting-on-research-integrity-science-and-publication-ethics.htm

#### **Boletim FAPERJ**

http://www.faperj.br/boletim\_interna.phtml?obj\_id=6840

### Jornal da Ciência

http://www.jornaldaciencia.org.br/Detalhe.jsp?id=75016



COPPEIUFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

#### Correio Braziliense

http://www.correiobraziliense.com.br/app/noticia/ciencia-e-saude/2010/12/11/interna ciencia saude,227303/pesquisadores-discutem-em-evento-etica-na-pesquisa-cientifica.shtml

Ministério do Planejamento

http://clippingmp.planejamento.gov.br/cadastros/noticias/2010/12/10/brasil-discute-a-etica-na-producao-cientifica

Ministério das Relações Exteriores

http://www.itamaraty.gov.br/sala-de-imprensa/selecao-diaria-de-noticias/midias-nacionais/brasil/o-globo/2010/12/10/brasil-discute-a-etica-na-producao-cientifica

**Portal CREA RJ** 

http://app.crea-rj.org.br/portalcreav3/CMS?idMateria=E45E6C32-03D1-6592-A3A0-0A78127060A3&idSecao=FA4B9D3E-40FB-570F-2407-CBAE81E54915

Estado de Minas

http://www.em.com.br/app/noticia/tecnologia/2010/12/11/interna\_tecnologia,197658/pesquisadores-discutem-etica-na-pesquisa-científica-em-evento.shtml

**International:** 

The National Science Foundation

http://www.nsf.gov/od/oise/intl-research-integrity.jsp

**Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE)** 

http://publicationethics.org/

Singapore Statement on Research Integrity (document that resulted from the Second World Conference on Research Integrity)

http://www.singaporestatement.org/nextsteps.html



COPPE|UFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

#### **Nature Events**

http://www.nature.com/natureevents/science/events/9482-First\_Brazilian\_Meeting\_on\_Research\_Integrity\_Science\_and\_Publication\_Ethics

**Council of Graduate Schools Newsletter** 

http://www.scholarlyintegrity.org/uploadedFiles/PSI/Newsletters/PSI\_Newsletter\_November-December 10.pdf

**Press Coverage after the Event:** 

Planeta COPPE

http://www.planeta.coppe.ufrj.br/imprimir\_artigo.php?artigo=1282

Jornal da Ciência (SBPC)

http://www.jornaldaciencia.org.br/Detalhe.jsp?id=75566

**British Medical Journal (BMJ)** 

http://blogs.bmj.com/bmj/2010/12/21/liz-wager-can-we-immunise-brazilian-science-against-fraud/

# **Ongoing and Future Initiatives:**

The I BRISPE has stimulated discussion on RI/RCR at major Brazilian public institutions, apart from those involved in the organization of the meetings. COPPE/UFRJ will reinforce the relevance of addressing RI specific topics among graduate students, with particular focus on plagiarism and authorship. Some seminars have been planned. IBqM/UFRJ has supported an initiative to develop credit courses on RI/RCR for graduate students and should have a group of professors contributing to research on RI/RCR at the international level shortly. PPGBIOS will include RI/RCR as part of the bioethics graduate course.



COPPEIUFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

USP will support further RI/RCR initiatives in its graduate programs and is willing to contribute to other national efforts to foster RI in Brazilian science. IAI is planning to submit a research project on RI ethics education and training to NSF (Ethics Education in Science and Engineering – EESE - solicitation on RI research and training). The Institute has also planned RCR initiatives as part of its 2011-2012 agenda. XIII Brazilian Meeting of Scientific Editors (Encontro Nacional de Editores Científicos, Nov 8-12, in Rio Grande do Sul) will be entitled "Integrity and Ethics in Scientific Publications (Integridade e Ética na Publicação Científica)", a suggestion of Professor Rosemary Shinkai (Pontifical Catholic University of Rio Grande do Sul - PUCRS), editorin-chief of the Journal of Dental Science (*Revista Odonto Ciência*), who attended the I BRISPE at USP. PUCRS has started to plan two meetings on research ethics/integrity for the whole university community, which should be held in September and November 2011. The FAPERJ post-doctoral project on RI/RCR, conducted by Sonia Vasconcelos, will continue as a research project and will include a national survey on plagiarism in Brazilian academia. Planning for the II BRISPE (2012) should start in May 2011.

## **Closing Remarks:**

The I BRISPE was the first effort in Brazil to address the current discussions on RI/RCR, which have been the focus of two world conferences, one in Lisbon, ESF-ORI First World Conference on Research Integrity (<a href="http://www.esf.org/activities/esf-conferences/details/2007/confdetail242.html">http://www.esf.org/activities/esf-conferences/details/2007/confdetail242.html</a>), 2007, and another in Singapore, Second World Conference on Research Integrity (<a href="http://www.wcri2010.org/index.asp">http://www.wcri2010.org/index.asp</a>), 2010, respectively, apart from other meetings on the same topic that have been held in the US and in EU countries, among others. Although time for planning of the event in Brazil was extremely short and funding to increase participation was rather scarce, the event succeeded in establishing a basis for the development of further actions to tackle the problem of research misconduct and questionable research practices in the country. Also, Brazil has now started to be acknowledged as the country in Latin America that has, through a national event, demonstrated interest in making RI/RCR part of its agenda.



COPPEIUFRJ . CBPF . USP . INPE

The role of the Academies of Sciences, Scientific Societies and International Journals to boost RI/RCR initiatives in many developed countries has proved to be fundamental, and Brazil should be no exception in this matter. As described at the beginning of this report, the general aim of the I BRISPE was to "include Brazil in the group of countries that have made RI/RCR policies part of the agenda of institutions and funding agencies and stimulate the involvement of the country's academic community in the development of policies and in decision making concerning ethics and research integrity at the international level." We feel that the meeting fulfilled this aim. Concerning the specific aims, which were to

- (1) raise awareness of, especially young researchers, of RI/RCR demands in today's research setting and call attention to the relevance of these demands for their role as authors and future supervisors.; (2) attract the attention of Brazilian scientific societies and editors of academic journals to the growing necessity of developing clear publication ethics policies; (3) assess the possibilities of including activities/initiatives related to RI/RCR in the Brazilian research community, the following considerations should be highlighted:
- (1) This aim may be fulfilled through a greater commitment of universities and funding agencies to taking a more significant role in global efforts to develop educational policies to foster RI/RCR all over the countries. The rationale for this assumption is that effective collaboration between researchers from different research traditions/academic cultures may be hindered by different perceptions of research misconduct and questionable research practices;
- (2) This aim was only partially fulfilled, as participation of editors and representatives of Brazilian Scientific Societies in the meetings was minor;
- (3) This aim was fulfilled and the possibilities are many, as long as all the actors involved in this context assume their share of responsibility for making RI/RCR research and training in Brazil a significant component in efforts to improve research quality in the country.

Sonia Vasconcelos and Martha Sorenson, March 2011
(on behalf of the Organizing Committee of the First Brazilian Meeting on Research Integrity,
Science and Publication Ethics)